CITY OF BELLEVILLE

Bronk Road Bridge Rehabilitation Class EA
Project File Report

May 2012
THE CORPORATION OF THE
CITY OF BELLEVILLE

BRONK ROAD BRIDGE REHABILITATION
CLASS ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT

Project File Report
SEI Project No. SN0220

MAY 2012

Sanchez Engineering Inc.
May 23, 2012

Mr. Barry Simpson
Project Manager,
Engineering and Development Services Department
City of Belleville
169 Front Street
Belleville, Ontario K8N 2Y8

Dear Mr. Simpson:

**Re:** Bronk Road Bridge Rehabilitation Class EA
Project File Report

We are pleased to submit the Project File Report for the Rehabilitation of the Bronk Road Bridge over Parks Creek.

This has been a very interesting assignment. We will be available to respond to any queries that may arise during the 30-day review period.

Please contact me should you require any clarification on our submission.

Respectfully submitted,

Original signed and Sealed
by L. Sanchez

Leonardo Sanchez, P.Eng.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................1
   1.1 Background..................................................................................................................... 1
   1.2 Need and Justification.................................................................................................... 1
   1.3 Study Area ...................................................................................................................... 2
   1.4 Class Environmental Assessment Process ................................................................. 2
   1.5 Selection of Schedule .................................................................................................... 6
   1.6 Purpose of Project File Report ....................................................................................... 6
   1.7 Project Team .................................................................................................................... 7

2 CONSULTATION PROCESS ........................................................................................8
   2.1 Notice of Project Commencement ................................................................................. 8
   2.2 Agency Consultation ...................................................................................................... 8
      2.2.1 Agencies Contacted ........................................................................................... 8
      2.2.2 Summary of Comments ................................................................................... 10
   2.3 Public Consultation ...................................................................................................... 11
   2.4 Public Information Centre ........................................................................................... 11
      2.4.1 Summary of Comments ................................................................................... 11
   2.5 First Nations Consultation ........................................................................................... 11

3 EXISTING ENVIRONMENT .......................................................................................12
   3.1 Socio-economic Environment ...................................................................................... 12
      3.1.1 Existing Land Uses ........................................................................................... 12
      3.1.2 Transportation Infrastructure ......................................................................... 12
      3.1.3 Utilities and Municipal Services ..................................................................... 12
   3.2 Natural Environment ................................................................................................... 12
      3.2.1 Species at Risk .................................................................................................. 12
      3.2.2 Fisheries Resources .......................................................................................... 12
      3.2.3 Geology and Geotechnical .............................................................................. 14
      3.2.4 Groundwater .................................................................................................... 15
      3.2.5 Hydrologic Analysis ........................................................................................ 15
      3.2.6 Hydraulic Analysis .......................................................................................... 16
   3.3 Existing Structure ......................................................................................................... 16

Sanchez Engineering Inc.  May 2012
3.4 Proposed Structure ....................................................................................................... 17
3.5 Cultural Environment .................................................................................................. 19
   3.5.1 Archaeological Resources ................................................................................ 19
   3.5.2 Victoria Cemetery ............................................................................................ 21

4 IDENTIFICATION OF PROBLEMS AND OPPORTUNITIES ....................................... 22
   4.1 Problem Statement ............................................................................................... 22
   4.2 Opportunity Statement .......................................................................................... 22

5 ALTERNATIVE SOLUTIONS AND EVALUATION ................................................... 23
   5.1 Alternatives Considered ....................................................................................... 23
   5.2 Evaluation Criteria ............................................................................................... 24
   5.3 Evaluation of Alternative Solutions ...................................................................... 24

6 PREFERRED SOLUTION ............................................................................................. 37
   6.1 Design Alternatives ............................................................................................... 37
   6.2 Potential Impacts and Mitigation Measures ......................................................... 37
   6.3 Permits and Approvals .......................................................................................... 38

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A Photographs
APPENDIX B Public and Agency Consultation

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2-1 List of Agencies and Stakeholders
Table 2-2 Summary of Comments
Table 3-1 Flow Estimates – Parks Creek at Bronk Road
Table 3-2 Existing Bridge – Water Surface Elevations at Bridge Entrance
Table 3-3 Existing Conditions – Water Surface Elevations Upstream of Weir
Table 3.4 Replacement Structure – Water Surface Elevation at Bridge Entrance
Table 3.5 Replacement Structure – Water Surface Elevations Upstream of Weir
Table 5.1 Alternative Solutions
City of Belleville  
Bronk Road Bridge Rehabilitation  
Project File Report

Table 5.2 Evaluation Criteria  
Table 5.3 Alternative Solutions – Life Cycle Costs  
Table 5.4 Positive and Negative Effects  
Table 5.5 Scoring of Alternatives  
Table 5.6 Results of Evaluation of Alternative Solutions  
Table 5.7 Construction Options Evaluation  
Table 6.1 Potential Impacts and Mitigation Measures

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1-1 Location Plan  
Figure 1-2 Study Area  
Figure 3-1 Parks Creek Watershed  
Figure 3-2 Existing Structure – Water Surface Profiles – 25 and 100 yr Floods  
Figure 3-3 11.9 m Span Replacement Structure – Water Surface Profiles – 25 and 100 year Floods  
Figure 3-4 16.0 m Span Replacement Structure – Water Surface Profiles – 25 and 100 year Floods  
Figure 3-5 Stage 2 Archaeological Investigation Area  
Figure 5-1 Staged Construction Using Existing Bridge  
Figure 5-2 Temporary Crossing West of Bridge, New Bridge Constructed in One Stage  
Figure 5-3 Temporary Crossing West of Bridge, New Bridge Constructed in Two Stages  
Figure 5-4 Temporary Crossing East of Bridge, New Bridge Constructed in Two Stages  
Figure 5-5 Temporary Crossing East of Bridge, New Bridge Constructed in One Stage  
Figure 6.1 Preliminary General Arrangement
1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The Bronk Road Bridge is located on Bronk Road about 0.2 km north of Thrasher Road and spans Parks Creek, a tributary of the Moira River. Bronk Road is the road allowance between Lots 26 and 27, Concession 6, former Township of Thurlow, as shown on Figure 1.1 – Location Plan.

The bridge records indicate that it was constructed in 1930, as a cast-in-place, single span concrete T-beam structure on concrete abutments. It appears to be founded on spread footings, possibly on bedrock. The bridge has a span of 11.9 m±, a total width of 6.2 m± and a roadway width of 4.9m±. It accommodates one lane of traffic.

The City provided with the RFP the 2009 and 2010 Municipal Structure Inventory and Inspection (MSII) reports completed for the bridge, and three property plans for the Bronk Road and environs.

The MSII reports for the bridge indicate that the Annual Average Daily Traffic at the bridge is 100. The road can be considered a low volume road.

The inspection of the bridge generally confirmed the findings of the MSII Inspection Reports for the areas that were accessible on June 15, 2011. Photos of the structure and the creek are included in Appendix A.

The reconstruction of the Bronk Road Bridge is classified as a Schedule B project under the provisions of the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment, 2007, since the new bridge will be for the same purpose and use, and at the same location, but its hydraulic and road capacity will be greater than existing. The Schedule B process involves the issuance of a Notice of Commencement, development and evaluation of alternatives and their effects on the natural, social, and economic environments, hosting of a Public Information Centre, selection of the preferred alternative, filing of the EA Summary Report, and issuance of a Notice of Completion.

1.2 Need and Justification

As required by legislation, the City inspects every structure within its jurisdiction every two years. The inspections are carried out based on the Ontario Structure Inspection Manual, prepared by the Ministry of Transportation (MTO).

The City's Municipal Structure Inventory and Inspection Report dated January 2011 identified the Bronk Road Bridge as priority number three (3). The MSII report estimates that the structure needs rehabilitation works estimated to cost $230,000 within the next 1 to 5 years, and that it would require replacement within the next 6 to 10 years, at an additional cost of $500,000.